

# SMALLHOLDERS AND THE INCLUSION DEBATES IN CERTIFICATION SCHEMES: PERSPECTIVES FROM PALM OIL CERTIFICATION IN THAILAND AND MALAYSIA

Marcel Djama  
Shaufique A. Sidique  
Tey Yeong Cheng  
Patchaya Songsienchai

# OUTLINE

1. SMALLHOLDERS AND PALM OIL CERTIFICATION
2. RESEARCH QUESTION & METHODOLOGY
3. EMBEDDED VERSUS DISEMBEDDED AGRICULTURAL EXTENSION SERVICES
4. CONCLUSION

## **I - SMALLHOLDERS AND PALM OIL CERTIFICATION**

# RISE AND PROLIFERATION OF FOOD STANDARDS



# PALM OIL CERTIFICATION



- RSPO CREATED IN 2004
- 2016: 17% OF THE GLOBAL PALM OIL



# SMALLHOLDERS' CHALLENGES



- RSPO SH: FAMILY FARMING LESS THAN 50ha
- SH: 40% OF WORLD PALM OIL
- ENVIRONMENTAL CONCERNS
- LEGITIMIZING DIMENSION (Inclusive VC)



# SMALLHOLDERS IN MALAYSIA



- CULTIVATE 41% OF OIL PALM PLANTED
- 30% MANAGED BY SCHEMES SMALLHOLDERS
- 11% MANAGED BY INDEPENDENT SMALLHOLDERS
- AVERAGE SIZE FARM= 4ha

# SMALLHOLDERS IN THAILAND



- CULTIVATE 70% OF PALM OIL PLANTED
- 90% OF THE PRODUCTION IN THE SOUTHERN PROVINCES OF KRABI & SURAT THANI
- AVERAGE SIZE PLOT OF 2ha



## **II - RESEARCH QUESTION & METHODOLOGY**

# CERTIFICATION AND THE RISE OF NON STATE ACTORS



- NEW PLAYERS, NEW SKILLS
- NEW ROLES: NGOS FROM ADVOCACY TO SERVICES DELIVERY
- PRIVATIZATION OF EXTENSION SERVICES/TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE TO FARMERS



**HOW ARE PRIVATE SUSTAINABILITY STANDARDS RESHAPING EXTENSION SERVICES?**

# SUSTAINABILITY STANDARDS AS TECHNOLOGIES OF GOVERNMENT

- DRAWING NEW BOUNDARIES BETWEEN STATE, CORPORATIONS AND CIVIL SOCIETY
- REDEFINING THE SCALES OF REGULATION (TRANSNATIONAL REGULATION VERSUS NATIONAL LAWS)
- ESTABLISHING A NEW REGIME OF CONTROL AND SURVEILLANCE THROUGH INTERNAL MONITORING, AUDIT, AND THIRD PARTY CERTIFICATION
- ESTABLISHING CONDITIONS TO ACCESS THE MARKET

# A GOVERNMENTALITY APPROACH

- EXTENSION SERVICES / TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE AS STRATEGIC SITES OF POWER
- TRAINING & « EMPOWERMENT » TO CREATE NEW SUBJECTIVITIES
- TO PROMOTE FREE, RATIONALE, CALCULATING SUBJECTS (Lemke, 2001)
- TO IMPLEMENT MARKET MECHANISM & ROLL BACK STATE WELFARE FUNCTIONS

## Krabi Province



## Study Sites

## Thailand

## FELDA Bukit Goh, Pahang

## Malaysia

## WAGS Beluran



## FELDA Tenggaroh, Johor



## Keresa Plantations and Mill



# METHODOLOGY



## SEMI-STRUCTURED INTERVIEWS WITH FARMERS & EXTENSION OFFICERS

Krabi Thailande N= 386

Felda Tenggara N = 125

Felda Bukit Goh N = 45

Wags Beluran Sabah N= 100

Keresas Sarawak N= 76

### **III - EMBEDDED VERSUS DISEMBEDDED AGRICULTURAL EXTENSION SERVICES**

# EXTENSION SERVICES – THE RURAL DEVELOPEMENT AGENDA



- SCHEMES SH ARE BOND BY CONTRACT TO MILLS
- SUPERVISED IN PLANTING AND FARM MANAGEMENT (FELDA, MPOB)
- SUPPORT: SEEDLINGS, FERTILIZERS, TA, CREDIT

# EXTENSION SERVICES – THE RURAL DEVELOPEMENT AGENDA (2)



- INDEPENDANT SH ARE NOT CONTRACTUALLY BONDED TO MILLS
- EXTENSION SERVICES FROM GOVERNMENT AGENCIES IN MALAYSIA (MPOB)
- FROM MINISTRY OF AGRICUTURE IN THAILAND



# PALM OIL IN A MULTIFUNCTIONAL AGRICULTURE AGENDA



BEYOND PALM OIL: NONFARM ACTIVITIES, RURAL MARKET TRANSFORMATION AND DIVERSIFICATION IN FELDA SCHEMES



# SMALLHOLDERS CERTIFICATION- THE RSPO NARRATIVE

- MAIN RATIONALE: SECURING THE SUPPLY OF CSPO
- A BUYER DRIVEN AGENDA
- NARRATIVE (OR FAIRY TALE?):
  - BETTER PRODUCTIVITY (PRODUCING MORE WITH LESS LAND)
  - TO REDUCE LAND CONVERSION
  - REWARDED BY ACCESS TO GLOBAL MARKET
  - AND AN INCREASED INCOME
- THE FOCUS IS ON PALM OIL FARMING – OTHER FARMERS ACTIVITIES TO SUPPORT THEIR LIVELIHOOD IS OUT OF THE SCOPE OF RSPO TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

# HOW TO GET CERTIFIED

- FORM A GROUP AND ASSIGN A GROUP MANAGER (MOST OF THE TIME AN EXTERNAL CONSULTANT OR NGO)
- IMPLEMENTATION OF AN INTERNAL CONTROL SERVICE
- PROVIDE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE ON RSPO P&C

## CONCLUSION

# CERTIFICATION AND THE PRIVATISATION OF EXT. SERVICES

- PAINFUL FOR A LIMITED GAIN (WITHOUT PREMIUM CERTIFICATION GENERATED INCOME ARE USED TO PAY THE TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE)
- EXTERNAL GROUP MANAGER IS DISEMBBEDING FARMERS FROM THEIR SOCIAL ENVIRONMENT
- DIVERSIFICATION AND OFF FARM ACTIVITIES AS LIVELIHOOD STRATEGIES ARE NOT SUPPORTED. FOCUS IS ON PRODUCTIVITY

# AN INSTITUTIONAL RESISTANCE

- IN THAILAND, A LACK OF COORDINATION IN THE VALUE CHAIN, PROLIFERATION AND COMPETITION AMONG MILLS GIVE A GOOD BARGAINING POWER TO FARMERS
- IN MALAYSIA, THE RECENT IMPLEMENTATION OF A NATIONAL CERTIFICATION SCHEME (MSPO) TO RETAKE CONTROL ON INDEPENDENT SMALLHOLDERS





**MERCI DE VOTRE ATTENTION**